

**JUDGING FORM (10-minute presentation)**  
**International Business Ethics and Sustainability Case Competition**  
**Loyola Marymount University**

<u>SESSION</u> (Date and Time)	<u>TOPIC</u>	<u>TEAM</u> (School and Division)

**Judge Information**

*If you have a business card, please leave with Senior Judge*

Name \_\_\_\_\_

Organization \_\_\_\_\_

Email \_\_\_\_\_

**General Instructions – 10-Minute Presentation**

This presentation focuses solely on the ethical issues and is given by two or three members of the team. Teams imagine that this presentation is the result of being called back after their full presentation in order to give a shorter presentation strictly about the ethical issues of their topic. There is no power point presentation, handouts or Q&A. Teams are expected to have incorporated feedback received from the full presentation into this 10-minute presentation.

Ethical Dimension

Please base your score on how well the team answered the following questions:

- From the standpoint of a secular, philosophical perspective, precisely why is the problem an ethical issue?
- What is the amount and type of tangible good and harm involved in the problem and in the solution?
- Are the actions themselves in this case (in the problem and solution) ethically defensible?
- Is there a conflict of rights? Does the solution resolve this?
- Is the solution ethically acceptable?

Scoring – How well did the team present the ethical issues in a straightforward way, relating them directly to central issues associated with running the organization? (The discussion of the ethical issues should have helped the team “sell” the team’s solution to the executives.) Check boxes below.

(1) <b>Outstanding</b>	(2) <b>Good</b>	(3) <b>Acceptable</b>	(4) <b>Marginal</b>	(5) <b>Weak</b>
Complicated ethical issues made easy to understand. Relevance to business concerns was clear and insightful.	Ethical issues explained simply. Connection to business concerns was clear.	Explanation needed development, but you got the general idea of the ethical issues and connection to the business concern.	You only partially understood the ethical issue (explanation not clear or too technical) and/or the connection to the business concern.	Explanation seriously incomplete. You barely understood the ethical issues.

*Did the team use technical philosophical language, cite philosophers as authorities or appeal to any religious tradition? (Not appropriate in typical business setting.)*

Yes                      No

## Presentation Skills

Please base your score on the following:

- Were the speakers comfortable enough with the material that they did not read from a script?
- Could all the speakers be heard?
- Did the team manage the time well?
- Was the team's professional demeanor appropriate for an executive presentation?
- How polished and professional was the presentation?

Scoring – Were you convinced by the team's analysis of the problem and suggested solution? Check boxes below.

<p style="text-align: center;">(1) <b>Outstanding</b> Convinced and I would act on their recommendations. You have no reservations.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">(2) <b>Good</b> Convinced. I have some reservations, but nothing major.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">(3) <b>Acceptable</b> More or less convinced. I have some reservations, but the presentation left me more convinced than unconvinced.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">(4) <b>Marginal</b> Almost convinced. I have major reservations that leave me unconvinced, and found more than 50% of the presentation unconvincing.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">(5) <b>Weak</b> Unconvinced. The presentation may have some good points, but clearly not enough to be convincing.</p>

General comments, if any: